

# Overview of measures for financing lifelong learning

Mari Liis Räis

Janno Järve



**European Union** European Social Fund



Investing in your future

This study was commissioned by the Ministry of Education and Research under the programme "Adult jobrelated training and developmental activities" and financed by the European Social Fund.

# Contents

In	troduc	tion	3
1.	Sho	rt typology of financing measures	4
	1.1.	Savings account	4
	1.2.	Individual learning accounts	5
	1.3.	Vouchers	6
	1.4.	Training loans	7
	1.5.	Direct financing of education providers	8
	1.6.	Tax incentives	9
	1.7.	Other support measures for adult learners	10
2.	Ove	rview of the implementation of the measures	.11
	2.1 Sa	vings/Learning accounts	12
	2.2 Vo	ouchers	15
	2.3 Tr	aining loans	21
	2.4 Ta	x incentives	27
	2.5 Gi	ants	30
	2.6 Tr	aining funds	37

# Introduction

The key to promoting lifelong learning is to overcome different barriers like low awareness, negative attitude towards learning and restricted economic opportunities. This analysis was commissioned by the Estonian Ministry of Education and Research with the aim of gathering international experience in designing financial support measures intended to support adults' participation in lifelong learning, with emphasis on measures that encourage private co-financing.

The focus of this study is on adult-oriented measures. We avoid descriptions of measures that are available to all people who study in general education systems, because that would have diverted us from the focus on the adult learner<sup>1</sup>. Similarly we do not include measures aimed at the unemployed. The main focus is on state level measures, smaller project based initiatives are not included in this overview.

**The first part of the overview** proposes a classification of lifelong learning financing measures, mostly on the basis of previous similar work. The purpose of this chapter is to describe theoretical models of financing lifelong learning. This will not include examples of actual real-life practices and is based on available literature and expert evaluation.

Although the classification is somewhat arbitrary, the following types of measures will be addressed:

- Saving accounts;
- Individual learning accounts;
- Vouchers;
- Training loans;
- Direct funding of education providers;
- Tax incentives;
- Other support measures for adult learners (grants).

When comparing these measures the reader must keep in mind that this is merely an overview and brings out the most distinctive characteristics, strengths and weaknesses. The actual performance of the measure may depend on the way the measure is being implemented and, of course, on the perspective of the evaluator. Also, very little information is available regarding the administrative burden of these measures (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010). The workload depends heavily on how the measure is being implemented and therefore remarks concerning administrative burden should be treated with some reservation.

**The second part** of this study presents real life examples of these measures, in order to compensate for the lack of detail in the theoretical overview. For this end a questionnaire was sent out to representatives of different countries to gather as detailed information as possible. The contacts of the respondents were provided by the Ministry of Education and Research. The outcomes are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> We have to admit that in some cases we have also described measures that are also available to adolescents, mostly because they are relevant to promotion of adult lifelong learning and because it was presumed they would be of interest to the Ministry of Education and Research of Estonia.

presented as tables which allow the reader to compare different implementation practices for similar measures. In addition to the measures listed in the classification, the second part also includes another type of financing called training funds. This is a mixed type of funding including some properties of saving accounts and some of state grants.

# 1. Short typology of financing measures

#### **1.1. Savings account**

A savings account is a savings plan which is meant to be used for covering educational expenses. The **purpose** of this measure is to improve accessibility of education through encouraging people to save money for education and to increase people's sense of responsibility to continue their education.

Important characteristics of the savings accounts system are (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010):

- Form and theme of learning generally it is up to the owner of the account to decide which expenses to pay using the plan and therefore any type of learning can be covered;
- **Owner of the account** usually the owner is a private person;
- **Target group** the measure isn't usually directed at any particular group in the society, but it has been found that doing so might improve the effectiveness of the measure (Cedefop 2009);
- **Making deposits** this can be organized in different ways. The account may be a usual private savings account in any bank and the owner makes all the deposits. It is also possible that the employer makes additional deposits.
- **State support** state support can be either direct or indirect, for example through tax reductions for the person and/or the employer. The state support may vary according to personal income or the amount of deposits.

Savings account may also be in the form of a fund.

Main **weaknesses** of savings accounts. Assuming that the savings account is set up like a usual savings account and state support is modest, the saved up sum is usually rather small and is therefore of little help when financing educational activities. This is especially true for people with low income for whom it is more difficult to set money aside anyway. Because the amount of funds in these accounts tends to be small, the accounts aren't very attractive to private banks that won't be able to profit from them. However the effectiveness of this measure is very much dependent on additional measures and the nature of the education system. It is also questionable whether this measure is financially reasonable given that it may reduce the liquidity of the person's assets significantly (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010). Having a savings plan assumes that the person is capable of planning his or her training needs a long time in advance and then able to follow it consistently. If the person does not have a clear vision of his/her training needs, the long-term plans may never be realised.

The main **strengths** of the measure are giving the person the freedom to plan his/her education path and moderate need for quality assurance. If we assume that the person knows best what and why he/she needs to learn, then this type of framework with very few restrictions is appropriate. For a person who is interested in planning their own education, this type of measure is likely to increase the accessibility of education and encourage participation in lifelong learning. The moderate need for quality assurance is due to the person's share in the measure. If most of the money comes from the person's own pocket, then the likelihood of abuse is very low and therefore there is little need to assure the quality of education providers or where exactly the money is being used.

The implementation of savings accounts may be accompanied by related measures like career counselling and advertisement campaigns, but not necessarily (Cedefop 2009). This probably increases effectiveness of the measure through wider awareness and better use of the measure.

## **1.2. Individual learning accounts**

The individual learning account is also a type of savings account but money in this account can only be used for education expenses. The main purpose of learning accounts is to improve accessibility of education and to increase people's sense of responsibility for continuing their education. The difference with a regular savings account is the fact that in addition to the person, the employer and/or state also contribute financially, which makes the accumulation of funds quicker and more motivating.

Important characteristics of the learning accounts system are:

- Theme and form of learning generally it is up to the person to choose, but depending on the particular system, both the employer and the state (through the legislation or administrative bodies) may have a say over which expenses are eligible or appropriate;
- **Owner of the account** the owner may be a private person or a company that is required to use the money for the education expenses of its employees (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010);
- **Target group** the measure isn't usually directed at any particular group in the society, but it has been found that doing so might improve the effectiveness of the measure (Cedefop 2009);
- **Making deposits** this can be organized in different ways. The account may be a regular private savings account in any bank and the owner makes all the deposits. It is also possible that the employer makes additional deposits either voluntarily or mandatorily;
- **State support** state support can be either direct or indirect financial support, for example through tax reductions for the person and/or the employer. State support may vary according to personal income or the amount of deposits. (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010);
- **Quality assurance** to assure the purposeful use of the money, some quality assurance measures are necessary.

The learning account may be a real bank account or a virtual one and it may be administered by a special administrative body either created especially for this purpose or an existing governmental organization (Cedefop 2009).

**Main weaknesses** of learning accounts. Most of the weaknesses of learning accounts are the same as those of saving accounts. Assuming that the savings account is set up like a usual savings account and state support is modest, the saved up sum is usually rather small and is therefore of little help when financing educational activities. This is especially true for people with low income for whom it is more difficult to set money aside anyway. If the contribution by the state is significant, then the

situation changes in some aspects. Bigger contribution means bigger administrative burden for administrating the accounts as well as regarding quality assurance.

Again, because the amount of funds in these accounts tends to be small the accounts aren't very attractive to private banks that won't be able to profit from them. However, the effectiveness of this measure is very much dependent on additional measures and the nature of the education system. It is also questionable whether this measure is financially reasonable given that it may reduce the liquidity of a person's assets significantly (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010).

Having a savings plan assumes that the person is capable of planning his or her training needs a long time in advance and then able to follow it consistently. If the person does not have a clear vision of his/hers training needs, the long-term plans may never be realised. This probably supports people who already see lifelong learning as a priority, meaning mostly better educated and therefore also people with higher income.

Assuming that the state contributes to the account significantly and the persons share is moderate, the system can be easily abused and need for quality assurance increases.

**The main strengths** of the measure are giving the person freedom to plan their own education. If we assume that the person knows best what and why he/she needs to learn, then this type of framework with very few restrictions is appropriate. For a person who is interested in planning their own education, this type of measure is likely to increase accessibility of education and encourage participation in lifelong learning.

The implementation of savings accounts may be accompanied by related measures like career counselling and advertisement campaigns, but not necessarily (Cedefop 2009). This probably increases effectiveness of the measure through wider awareness and better use of the measure.

#### **1.3.** Vouchers

Vouchers are coupons, usually issued by the state, which can be used to pay for training and education. The purpose of this measure is to improve accessibility of education through significant financial support by the state and to strengthen people's sense of responsibility regarding their education path through enabling them to choose between different schooling opportunities.

Important characteristics of the voucher system are:

- Theme and form of education the exact type of schooling is usually up to the voucher receiver, but the selection of education providers where the voucher can be used may be restricted by the issuer;
- **Receiver** may be both a private person or an organization;
- **Target group** this measure usually isn't targeted at any particular group, although this would be fairly easy to do;
- Using the vouchers this may be set up differently. Most commonly the receiver of the voucher needs to inform the educational institution before starting the chosen course of training that they wish to use the voucher. The invoice for the sum covered by the voucher is

sent directly to the state's administrative body and the "owner" of the voucher isn't involved in that process. If the voucher doesn't cover all the costs of the chosen training then the participating person is required to co-finance the rest;

- **State support** state support may be up to 100% of the schooling fees or cover only part of them. As a general rule an upper limit is set for the voucher or the voucher acts as a discount coupon, covering for example 50% of the costs, but even in that case there usually is a upper limit for the expenses. The amount of support or the eligibility for the measure may depend on personal income.
- Quality assurance to prevent exploitation of the system through fictitious education providers it has been considered important to establish qualification criteria for all education providers in the frame of this measure. In addition to assure purposeful use of the money, participants may be required to pay back the amount covered by the voucher if they do not attend or finish their studies.

The voucher may be in the form of actual physical coupons or virtual.

The main **weakness** of this system is the significant amount of administrative burden it creates. The voucher system requires an effective communication strategy, constant availability of up-to-date information and an administrative body that distributes the vouchers and coordinates all the payments to education providers. Of course, these tasks could be given to already existing governmental organisations. As already mentioned some quality assurance is also necessary.

**On the positive side,** voucher systems stand out as quite effective measures both for increasing participation in lifelong learning and for increasing attainability of education. The effectiveness depends on the appropriate value of the voucher and on the eligibility criteria for receiving it (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010).

As already mentioned, gathering all the relevant information on which education providers are eligible etc. is a crucial part of this measure. This way people have the overview they need and can make their choices from among all the available options. So the effectiveness of the measure depends on a working communication strategy and compulsory career counselling may also benefit the system greatly (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010).

#### **1.4.** Training loans

Training or educational loans are low-interest loans for education expenses with the purpose of easing accessibility of education. Loans may be targeted at both individuals and employers. Some loans can only be used to pay for fees of the training programme, others allow the borrower decide which expenses need to be covered.

Important characteristics of the training loans system are (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010):

• **Theme and form of education** – this is up to the borrower, but there are usually time and monetary restriction as well as limited forms of education that can be financed;

- **Qualifying for a loan** the loan is usually easily accessible, meaning there are no further conditions except participation in schooling, nevertheless some states require a guarantor or collateral for the loan;
- **Target group** the measure isn't usually targeted at a specific group, but it is mostly used by younger people. The measure may be targeted at individuals as well as organisations;
- **State support** training loans are usually guaranteed by the state and the state also subsidises interest. Still, all of the educational expenses are paid by the person taking the loan;
- **Repaying the loan** repayment of the loan usually starts immediately after training is finished. The obligation to start repayment may be dependent on the person's income.

A **weakness** of the training loans system is its poor effectiveness in bringing the disadvantaged and other risk groups into education and lifelong learning. Although the loan is accessible to nearly everyone, it may still include limiting factors like the need for a guarantor.

The main **strength** of the measure is that most training loan systems allow the borrower to decide which expenses to cover. In addition to fees for the training programme, accommodation and learning supplies may be financed through the loan.

Training loan is a measure that doesn't require complementary measures, but some financial literacy is expected of the participants and therefore financial counselling may be important when implementing this.

# **1.5.** Direct financing of education providers

Direct funding of education providers outside the usual education system usually means that the state commissions certain training programmes in which people can participate for a symbolic fee or completely for free. The aim of these training programmes is to increase the supply of good quality programmes and thereby increase participation in lifelong learning.

Important characteristics of the direct funding system are:

- Theme and form of education are limited by the state; often short training programmes are preferred and people get to choose between the subjects the state has commissioned;
- **Target group** this measure is often targeted at certain groups, mostly at risk groups, but the programmes may also be available for everyone;
- **Quality assurance** the quality of state commissioned training programmes is usually assured by strict qualification criteria for education providers; follow-up inspections are a possible additional assurance.

From the perspective of individuals participating in these education programmes, the **main weakness** of the measure is the restricted freedom of choice. Also, this measure may not be effective in bringing in new participants and therefore mostly supports people who are already active lifelong learners.

The **strength** of this measure lies in the simple control over the use of public money and the opportunity to support themes that are deemed important. For the individuals participating in these programmes educational expenses are reduced to minimum, thereby improving accessibility.

Direct funding does not need any accompanying measures, but career counselling may be beneficial for some (potential) participants.

This measure is not included in the following comparison of implementations because of its widespread use, largely varying nature and dependence on the countries' education systems as a whole.

## **1.6.** Tax incentives

Income tax and value added tax (VAT) are the main types of taxes that are involved when talking about tax incentives regarding education. Typically these incentives are tax exemptions on educational expenses but may also include a bonus exemption for other expenses. The purpose of this measure is to increase the motivation of individuals and employers to participate actively in lifelong learning (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010).

Important characteristics of the tax incentives system are (Dohmen & Timmermann 2010; Cedefop 2009c; Eurydice network 2011):

- Theme and form of education Training programmes that qualify for tax exemption aren't usually limited in their theme, but may be restricted to approved education providers or whether employers' in-house training can be exempted;
- **Target group** The receiver of the tax exemption may be a private person or an organisation that has provided education opportunities to the employees. The measure can be targeted at more specified target groups, but usually isn't;
- **Participant's contribution** tax exemption usually applies to income tax and therefore the participant's own contribution is large, also the relief is commonly implemented through next year's tax returns and there is a delay in receiving the "discount";
- State support state support is indirect and the extent of the tax exemption may vary from under to over 100% of education expenses. Tax exemption over 100% means that additional tax relief is given as a bonus for other expenses as well. The relief may apply to limited amount of educational expenses in a given year.

**The weak point** of this measure is the delay that occurs between the time education related expenses are made and the time tax exemptions are approved and money returned. This delay means that the individual (or company) needs to already have sufficient funds to pay for all the expenses. So the exemption works more as a bonus for those who are already participating but provides disadvantaged groups with very little help (Cedefop 2009b). Therefore this measure is not effective in bringing new groups of people into lifelong learning.

The **strengths** of this measure are simple implementation and low administrative burden which can be delegated to already existing tax offices.

Tax incentives aren't accompanied by other supportive measures.

#### **1.7.** Other support measures for adult learners

By other support measures we mean mostly direct financial support which is targeted at adult learners to support the compensation of additional expenses that occur during studies. These expenses may be transportation, childcare, but also acquiring learning resources like books. Sometimes economic coping in general is also supported through this measure, because while learning individuals' time resources are more strained and may not allow earning a living wage. The form on support may bear different names: grants, scholarships, economic aid, sponsorship etc.

Important characteristics of other support measures are (Eurydice network 2011):

- **Supported expenses** often the support is earmarked for specific expenses (e.g. for transportation), but it may also be more vaguely purposed (e.g. economic support);
- **Target group** financial support may be available for all people participating in lifelong learning or it may be directed to specific groups who are considered to be more in need (e.g. support for childcare to parents of young children);
- Form of support the support may be one-time or recurrent, depending on the purpose of the measure. Amount of the support and the eligibility criteria also vary depending on the exact aim.

A **weakness** of this measure is that purposeful use of the money is very difficult to verify and this isn't usually done at all. Universal support measures are expensive for the state, so a more targeted approach to this measure might be more cost-effective.

On **the positive side** this type of support measures take into account other expenses in addition to regular fees that occur during studies. This is especially important for including disadvantaged groups in lifelong learning. These types of support measures have been seen as making more of an impact on participation than other possible financial support measures (Cedefop 2009b).

These measures do not need additional services or other accompanying measures.

# 2. Overview of the implementation of the measures

Below, we present the results of a survey carried out among government officials of selected OECD countries, whose contacts were provided us by Estonian Ministry of Education and Research.<sup>2</sup> They are grouped together so that it is possible to compare similar types of policy measures. In some cases, this means that the measures are quite easily comparable. However, several tables include quite a broad selection. It should also be noted that for some of the measures, additional Internet sources were used to complement the data from the questionnaire, references to further information sources can be found under "other comments".

When using this material, the reader needs to apply some critical thinking regarding the strengths and weaknesses of measures. These were mostly provided by the persons responding to the questionnaire and should therefore be considered as opinions on the performance of the measure. What is seen as positive or negative can vary greatly in different countries and certainly by different people. In most cases, we could not find thorough impact assessments. Nevertheless, we believe that these opinions are valuable and give reader some idea why, for what purpose, or at what costs the measure is implemented and whether this could also be used in another context (country or region).

The reader also needs to be tentative regarding comparison of numbers, because not all figures are given for the same year or the same target group. Sometimes figures include other measures which are usually seen as interwoven with the one being described. Thus, the reader should be extra careful and take notice of any comments in the figures boxes. Reading the costs of measures one should also bear in mind that the so called long-scale number naming system<sup>3</sup> is used here.

#### Notation used in the tables:

NA means "no answer" for that question was given, meaning that information on that aspect is lacking.

A dash (-) stands for "no relevant information" and therefore does not mean that information was lacking but that this particular aspect is of no importance regarding the specific measure.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The questionnaires were sent to 20 national experts, 3 of them replied that they do not have measures that are of interest to us, 10 experts provided us with one or several measure descriptions (Canada, Denmark, Finland, Greece, Italy, Netherlands, Switzerland, Sweden, UK, US). Hereby we would like to thank the experts for their valuable input. <sup>3</sup> Million = 1 000 000

Milliard = 1000 \* million = 1000 \* 1 000 000

Billion = 1000 \* milliard = million \* million = 1 000 000 \* 1 000 000

2.1 Savings/Lear	USA	Canada
	529 Savings Account	Lifelong Learning Plan (LLP)
Cool	0	
Goal	A 529 is a tax-advantage investment vehicle in the United States designed to encourage saving for the future higher education expenses of a designated beneficiary.	Allows students to temporarily withdraw amounts from their registered retirement savings plans (RRSPs) to finance training or education for themselves or their spouse.
Target group	Citizens	Citizens and residents
	Any labour market status	Any labour market status Any educational background Registered Retirement Savings Plan is a requirement to apply
Description of the measure	Savings account for future tuition fees and some plans allow for room and board, books, and computers to be covered from it as well. It is plan dependent. All 50 U.S. states offer at least one type of 529 savings accounts. <b>Pre-paid tuition plans</b> generally allow college savers to purchase units or credits at participating colleges and universities for future tuition and, in some cases, room and board. Most prepaid tuition plans are sponsored by state governments and have residency requirements. Many state governments guarantee investments in pre-paid tuition plans that they sponsor. <b>College savings plans</b> generally permit a college saver (also called the "account holder") to establish an account for a student (the "beneficiary") for the purpose of paying the beneficiary's eligible college expenses. An account holder may typically choose among several investment options for his or her contributions, which the college savings plan invests on behalf of the account holder. Investment options often include stock mutual funds, bond mutual funds, and money market funds, as well as, age-based portfolios that automatically shift toward more conservative investments as the beneficiary gets closer to college age.	Student has to have a Registered Retirement Savings Plan, and be enrolled (or has received an offer to enrol before March of the next year) as a full-time student, at a designated educational institution and in a qualifying educational program. Withdrawn amounts do not count as income and are not taxed. To make an LLP withdrawal, you must fill out a form and submit it to the RRSP issuer. The plan allows you to withdraw up to \$10,000 in a calendar year from your registered retirement savings plans (RRSPs). Over a period of 10 years, you have to repay to your RRSPs the amounts you withdrew under the LLP. Any amount that you do not repay when due will be included in your income (and subject to tax) for the year it was due. You cannot participate in the LLP to finance your children's training or education You cannot participate in the LLP after the end of the year you turn 71. The student must enrol on a full time basis but if the student meets the disability conditions, the student can enrol on a part- time basis.

# 2.1 Savings/Learning accounts

Size of the support	Many college saving plans have contribution limits in excess of \$200 000 (149 532€). Tax advantages vary across states. Pre-paid tuition plans have varied restrictions.	Up to \$10 000 (7241€) in a calendar year.
Trues of learning		Tautiany advantion
Types of learning	Tertiary education	Tertiary education
supported		Formal vocational education
	d organizational aspects	1
Administrative body	These plans can either be administered by states, state agencies or higher education institutions – differs across states.	Governmental organization: Canada Revenue Agency. This is the agency that is responsible for collecting income taxes.
Role of the administrative body	Decides who are eligible.	Is involved in choosing the education provider and curriculum; decides who are eligible; coordinates cooperation between different stake holders.
Role of the participant	Decides on the curriculum and education provider.	Chooses the suitable curriculum and education provider, and co-finance the studies from other sources in addition to the retirement plan. Needs to report thoroughly and provide relevant documents after studies. Participant also coordinates some activities between the different stake holders.
Role of education providers	Education providers may also be the administrative bodies in some states.	Education providers only organize the training and provide information about learning opportunities.
Quality assurance	Expenses that are not related to studies are taxable when covered through these plans.	Qualification criteria for education providers. To assure the purposeful use of money the participant has to provide letter from educational institution confirming enrolment in the program.
Communication of the measure	Websites of existing government agencies or education providers Commercials in TV Commercials on the radio Pamphlets in schools	Special website Websites of existing government agencies or education providers Special information hotline Pamphlets in workplaces Word of mouth, and financial institutions promoting the program

Financing			
Source	Participants own financing	State budget and personal retirement fund.	
Spending	Average balances for 529 plans:	2007: \$101 015 000 CDN (73 million €)	
	2011: \$15 349 (11 564€)	Per participant: \$6646 CDN (4812€).	
	2012: \$17 174 (12 940€)		
	Total investments:		
	2011: (\$165 billion) 124 billion €		
	2012: (\$190.7 billion) 144 billion €		
Participants	2011: 10,7 million	2007: 15 200	
	2012: 11,1 million		
Evaluation of the m	easure		
Complimentary	NA	Not necessary.	
measures			
Strengths	The ability to transfer unused amounts	Allows students to dip temporarily into	
	to other qualified members of the	tax sheltered retirement savings account	
	beneficiary's family without incurring	without tax penalties to further one's	
	any tax penalty.	studies.	
Weaknesses	Having a 529 plan may reduce eligibility	This program only helps those who have	
	for other financial aid during studies.	accumulated retirement savings.	
Overall assessment	In effect since 2006. Young people with	The administrative burden is fairly	
of the measure	the 529 Plan are 7 times more likely to	minimal as the program is integrated	
	attend college.	within the regular income tax system. In	
		effect since 1999.	
Comments and	http://www.sec.gov/investor/pubs/intro5	http://www.cra-	
further information	<u>29.htm</u>	arc.gc.ca/E/pub/tg/rc4112/README.html	
sources	http://www.irs.gov/uac/529-Plans:-		
	Questions-and-Answers		

# **2.2 Vouchers**

	Switzerland Chèque annuel de Formation (CAF) Genève	Switzerland Kulturlegi	Finland Training voucher (Opintoseteli)	Italy Catalogo Interregionale Alta Formazione	Greece Voucher for initial vocational education & training (post- secondary)
Goal	To facilitate the participation of people with low income in educational activities.	To provide disadvantaged people with discounts for cultural participation, sports activities and education.	To reduce or cover entirely the education fees of such students who belong to certain target groups and whose studies do not aim for any degree.	To increase the employability and skills of young people and workers	Financial incentive to cover the fees or part of the fees of studying to promote lifelong learning.
Target group	Residents of a specific region (and those living close by but working in the region) Any educational background Any labour market status Aged 18+ Income up to 71 785€	Residents of specific regions Income up to 29 600€ for a one person household.	Citizens and residents Unemployed or inactive The target groups include immigrants, the unemployed, retired, seniors (age 63+), people who have quit their studies and people with lower level education.	Residents of specific regions Upper Secondary or Tertiary education The target groups are: graduates (Tertiary education, regardless of employment status) and upper secondary school graduates employed	Citizens and residents. Any educational background Any labour market status Aged 15+
Description of the measure	The student must first choose a course then apply for the voucher before the start of the course. If the person is seen as eligible, the voucher is sent to them by mail. The student must then give the voucher to the education provider he's chosen. Voucher has to be used within a year.	It is a private initiative implemented by Caritas. Education providers (public and private) offer a 30 to 70% course fee reduction for people whose income is below a certain limit. (Comparable to the Carnet de familia numerosa in Spain for example.)	The Ministry of Education and Culture has granted funds for student vouchers for liberal adult education institutions. The voucher works as a discount and requires co-financing. The time the voucher can be used is limited: The government subsidy granting letter states that	The voucher is issued for a specific course and must be used by the end of it. The duration of the course is not limited. Participants can receive the voucher more than once.	The voucher can be used for covering the fee or part of the fee for learning. The voucher is limited in its use with minimum course price, set course length and restricted time of use.

	1				
		ucher can also be	this year's subsidy can be		
		or participating in	used for training starting		
	cultural		from 1.8.2013 and ending		
		egi itself accredits	31.12.2014.		
		holder is needy.			
-		70% reduction of	The value of the student	Up to a maximum of	Value of the voucher is
		course fee and the	voucher can be decided	6.000€. In the case of	300€ with no co-
		ant is expected to	by the education	courses with a higher fee	financing required.
consecutiv	5	nce the rest. The	provider; e.g. 10€	than the amount of	
No co-fina	8 1	of the discount is	discount of course fee of	vouchers granted, co-	
		by the education	60 €. Participants are	financing by the	
	provide	r.	required to co-finance.	participants is required.	
				The maximum hour/student cost	
				parameter of the voucher is $25 \notin /$ hour.	
True of Equation 1 of	neral education Work/la	ah ann maaileat	Studies in liberal adult		Formal vocational
TypesofFormal gelearningTertiary ed		abour market training (including	education not leading to	Tertiary education Upper-Secondary	Formal vocational education
supported Formal		ing that is directly	qualification.	education	Work/labour market
education		ble on the labour	quanneation.	education	related training
Work/labo					(including all training
	,	ork related training			that is directly applicable
	that is directly (includi	Ŭ			on the labour market)
	on the labour education	U			on the habour market)
market)		ducation			
,		inity learning			
	e.g. paying for	inty loaning			
	al examination)				
F					
With min	imum duration				
of 40h.					
Administrative and orga	nizational aspects				
Administrative Governme	ntal Loan Non-go	vernmental	Liberal adult education	Governmental	Governmental
1		( erinnentur			
body office		ation Caritas.	institutions: adult	organizations Regions	organization

Role of the administrative body	and VET/PET/CET) Decides who are eligible and co-finances.	Decides who are eligible, provides information about participating education providers.	high schools, study centres and summer universities providing liberal adult education. There is no special administrative body, see role of education providers.	Provinces Chooses the appropriate educational provider, provides information about training opportunities, co-finances the training; decides who are eligible, provides career counselling and coordinates cooperation between different stakeholders.	Provides information about learning opportunities, co-finances the studies, decides who are eligible, provides career counselling, is involved in the choosing of appropriate theme and form of education, coordinates the cooperation between different stake holders. Also organizes training, gives feedback on the training, submits documents and reports thoroughly on training activities being financed.
Role of the participant	Chooses the curriculum and education provider from the list of accepted providers needs to provide documentation before the start of the studies to apply, may co- finance.	Chooses the curriculum, finances studies.	Chooses the appropriate curriculum and education provider, co-finances studies and is obliged to give feedback on studies.	The participant decides on the theme and form of study with the input from the administrative body, employer, education provider and social partners.	The participant chooses the theme and form of education and the education provider with the help of other stake holders. After training is obliged to give feedback and submit needed documents.
Role of education providers	Provideinformationaboutlearningopportunitiesand reportsthoroughlyon	Educationprovidersparticipatevoluntarilyand may use the vouchersystemas"social	Help to choose the right curriculum, provide information about learning opportunities,	Are obliged to give feedback and report thoroughly on training activities, have to submit	Decide who are eligible;providecareercounsellingandinformationabout

	training activities being	branding" to boost their	co-finance, decide who	the relevant	learning opportunities.
	financed.	public image. They	are eligible and provide	documentation.	Are involved in choosing
	intuneed.	provide information	career counselling. Need	documentation.	the right curriculum. Are
		about learning	to give feedback, provide		obliged to give feedback
		opportunities.	necessary documents and		ant to submit needed
		-FF	report thoroughly on		documents and to report
			training activities.		thoroughly on training
			C		activities.
Role of the	-	-	-	Is involved in the	Is involved in the
employers				choosing of the	choosing of the
				appropriate theme and	appropriate theme and
				form of study.	form of study and the
					educational provider.
					May organize the
					training, provides
					information about
					learning opportunities.
Quality	Only course providers	There is only money from	Both funding and future	Participants co-financing	Both funding and
assurance	with a special contract are	participants involved.	qualification depend on	is assured by later	qualification for the
	eligible - for this a set of criteria needs to be met	They are expected to	the education provider	administrative audits. For	measure of the education
	by the provider.	make good choices.	matching the qualification criteria.	education providers a set of qualification criteria	providers depends on three measures:
	The voucher itself can't		Purposeful use of the	need to be met and a	qualification criteria;
	be used for anything		money is assured by the	given share of students	feedback from
	except paying for		qualification criteria and	need to finish their	participants and tests or
	courses.		the education provider is	studies there in order for	examination of
	eourses.		responsible of reporting	the provider to qualify in	participants. This also
			the use of this financing	the future. This also	serves to assure the
			to the Finnish National	serves to assure the	purposeful use of the
			Board of Education.	purposeful use of the	money.
				money.	-
Communication	Special website	Special website	Websites of existing	Special website	Special website
of the measure	Websites of existing	Websites of existing	government agencies or		Websites of existing
	government agencies or	government agencies or	education providers		government agencies or
	education providers	education providers			education providers

					Pamphlets in workplaces
Financing					
Source	State budget and tripartite training funds	Education providers participate on a "solidarity" basis (they earn less by accepting to give fee reductions).	State budget	ESF	State budget and ESF
Spending	2009: 2,7 Million Per participant: 535€ Not including administrative costs	No direct costs.	2008: 1,5 Million € 2009: 1,5 Million € 2010: 1,6 Million € 2011: 3,2 Million € 2012: 2,5 Million €	<ul> <li>2008: 27 Million €</li> <li>Per participant 10 385€</li> <li>2009: 27 Million €</li> <li>Per participant 5217€</li> <li>2010: 35 Million €</li> <li>Per participant 2253€</li> </ul>	NA
Participants /vouchers	2008: 4943 2009: 5087 (Population of the canton: 472,530)	2012:45000(Kulturlegis issued)1370education(andculture)providersinvolved.	NA	2008: 2600 2009: 5175 2010: 15537	NA
Evaluation of the	measure				
Complimentary measures	Not necessary	Not necessary	NA	Not necessary	Voluntary career counselling
Strengths	NA	Very simple "inclusion" measure with low budgets involved.	The access to education is easier for such groups of citizens, which are not used to educating themselves.	NA	Reduces the cost of training; Addresses inequality in education and training.
Weaknesses	The measure is not tailored (income limit is very high; no rest- rictions as to educational background > 40% of the participants have already a tertiary degree);	NA	NA	NA	It does not necessarily promote a learning culture – it can favour clientelistic practices.

	and very costly.				
Overall	The administrative	Active since 1996.	Active since 2007.	Active since 2006.	In effect since 2011-2012
assessment of the	burden of this measure				and hasn't yet been fully
measure	is considered low	No overall assessment was	No overall assessment was		evaluated because it is so
	(standardised online	given.	given.	given.	new.
	request; restricted				
	number of course				
	providers); and vouchers				
	are popular among the				
	target group. Measure				
	has been active since				
	2001.				
Comments and	http://ftp.iza.org/dp4017	http://www.kulturlegi.ch			
further	<u>.pdf</u>	/de/f92000102.html			
information					
sources					

# 2.3 Training loans

	Sweden	Switzerland	UK	Denmark
	Student aid (loan and grant)	Grants and loans	24+ Advanced Learning Loans	State educational grant and loan (SU)
Goal	To make it easier to study and thereby contribute to a high level of participation in the education system. Moreover, it is intended to level out the differences between individuals and groups in the population so as to make society fairer.	Grants or loans for adults in secondary and tertiary formal education. Not specifically targeted on adults re-entering the formal	The policy was set out in the reform plan document New Challenges, New Chances in December 2011, following public consultation. Grant funding is being prioritised for those with the greatest need. The purpose of this is to prevent	Society lends students a helping hand in covering living costs for a great variety of courses and studies to support studying regardless of social standing. <i>The scheme is aimed at younger</i> <i>people but adults can also</i>
	~	education system!	a fall in learner numbers.	receive it.
Target group	Citizens and residents Any educational background Any labour market status	Residents of a specific region Any educational background Any labour market status	Residents Any educational background Any labour market status Aged 24+	Citizens Any educational background Any labour market status Aged 18+
	Age limitations vary by type of learning, generally including all adults up to 54 years of age.	There are income and age limits.		Non-citizens need to meet additional criteria.
Description of the measure	Student aid can be granted for full- or part-time studies. Student aid consists partly of a loan and partly of a grant that is disbursed for the period of study, normally 40 weeks per academic year. There are some limitations on the right to student aid that are linked to the period of study and to the student's age. The sum paid as a student loan is around two-thirds of the total amount of student aid.	Grants and loans are regulated by the cantons. They may differ. In general, requirements are that the education leads to a certificate of the formal education system. A loan can usually be acquired all through studies until the first tertiary degree is achieved.	The loan is paid directly to the college or training provider. Repaying the loan begins after completion of studies and once they earn over £21,000 (24 $387\varepsilon$ ) per year. Interest is inflation (Retail Prices Index) plus 3% during studies. After completion of studies: for income less than 24 $387\varepsilon$ , inflation; income between 24 $387\varepsilon$ and 47 $610\varepsilon$ , inflation plus	The grant and loan covers living costs for a great variety of courses and studies. All studies must be full-time. There are two main support programmes. 1. Students following a youth education program i.e. a general upper secondary, vocational upper secondary or vocational education and training program. No time limits are placed on this type of support.
	The student aid system presumes repayment of student loans.		up to 3%; income over 47 610 $\in$ , inflation plus 3%.	2. Students enrolled in higher education courses are entitled to

	Repayment begins at the beginning of the year following the conclusion of studies and normally continues for 25 years. Interest is added directly to the			a number of monthly grants corresponding to the prescribed duration of the chosen study, plus 12 months. Inside a maximum of 70 grants students
	debt. The interest rate is			can change from one course to
	advantageous compared with other interests on loans and takes			another. On completion of their studies,
	account of tax deduction rules in			students must start paying back
	the tax system. Security clauses			the State loans. The repayment
	are also built into the repayment system, which make it possible			must begin one year after the end of the year, in which they have
	to take account of an individual's ability to pay.			completed their studies. The duration of the period of
	ability to pay.			repayment must not exceed 15
				years.
				The interest rate is 4% yearly
				during the time of attaining
				education, after finishing the education it is max 1%.
				education it is max 170.
				There are additional criteria
				regarding the size of students'
				income in order to obtain grants
0. 0.1		C: 1 1' 1	M : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : : :	and loans.
Size of the support	Student aid for full-time studies in 2012 amounts to	Size and conditions vary by cantons.	Maximum size of support £300 GBP (348 $\in$ ), one person can	Maximum size of the loan is 2 943 DKK (395€) /per month,
support	approximately SEK	cantons.	apply 4 times during one training	in addition a completion loan can
	9 $660(1112\mathfrak{E})$ per month of	No guarantor or collateral	programme.	be taken out under similar
	studies (nine months/year).	needed.	P D	conditions in the last year of
	However, student aid is usually		No guarantor or collateral	studies and its purpose is to
	disbursed four weeks at a time		needed.	support the successful
	for 10 months per year. The total			completion of studies.
	sum for each four week period in			
	2012 amounts to SEK 8 920			No guarantor or collateral

	(1026€).			needed.
	No guarantor or collateral needed.			
learning supported	Formal general education Tertiary education Formal vocational education Work/labour market related training (including all training that is directly applicable on the labour market) Non-work related training (including liberal education etc.) Civic education	Formal general education Tertiary education Formal vocational education	Formal general education Tertiary education Formal vocational education Work/labour market related training (including all training that is directly applicable on the labour market) Non-work related training (including liberal education etc.)	Formal general education Tertiary education Formal vocational education
Administrative	and organizational aspects			
Administrative body	Governmental organization CSN - The National Board of Student Aid; 900 are employed to implement this measure	Cantonal offices (cantonal budgets and financial participation of Confederation for tertiary education grants and loans)	The Student Loans Company is a non-profit Government-owned organisation set up in 1989 to provide loans and grants to students in universities and colleges in the UK. Funding will be from the Skills Funding Agency, a partner organisation of the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (BIS), and which exists to fund and promote adult further education (FE) and skills training in England.	The grant and loan system is managed by the Danish Agency for Higher Education and Educational Support in collaboration with all educational institutions and under the auspices of the Danish Ministry of Science, Innovation and Higher Education.
Role of the administrative body	CSN decides who qualifies, coordinates cooperation between different stakeholders, reports, co-finances	Decides who is eligible; co- ordinates cooperation between different stakeholders, co- finances.	Decides who is eligible; co- ordinates cooperation between different stakeholders, co- finances.	Decides who is eligible; co- ordinates cooperation between different stakeholders.
Role of the participant	Chooses the appropriate educational	Chooses the appropriate curriculum and education	Chooses the appropriate curriculum and education	Chooses the suitable curriculum and education provider, may co-

	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· 1 C· / 1·	· 1 C· / 1·	C' ( 1'
	institution, applies for support	provider, co-finances studies.	provider, co-finances studies.	finance studies.
	and provides necessary	report thoroughly on training		
	paperwork after studies, co-	activities that have been		
	finances studies.	financed, give feedback and		
		submit documentation after		
		training programme is finished		
Role of	Provide information about	Provide information about	Provide information about	Provide information about
education	learning opportunities, also	learning opportunities	learning opportunities, involved	learning opportunities, also
providers	career counselling. After studies		in choosing the most appropriate	career counselling, and decide
•	are concluded submits		form of studies for the student,	who are eligible. Need to submit
	appropriate documents.		report thoroughly on training	relevant documentation and
			activities that have been	report thoroughly on training
			finances, give feedback and	activities.
			submit documentation after	
			training programme is finished	
Quality	Only students in education	Only selected providers are	The money is transferred	There is no direct control over
assurance	institutions satisfying the	eligible. There is no direct	directly to the educational	the use of money.
assurance	qualification criteria and expert	control over the purposeful use	provider so students have no	the use of money.
	assessment can receive the	of the money given to students.	way of misusing the money.	
	support. Use of the money by	of the money given to students.	way of misusing the money.	
	students is not inspected.			
Communication	Website	Websites of existing government	Websites of existing government	Special website
of the measure	Information hotline	agencies or education providers	agencies or education providers	Websites of existing government
				agencies or education providers
Financing				
	State budget	State budget	State budget	State budget
Spending	2010: 1,37 milliard €	2011: 247 million € in grants	NA	2008: 282 million €
_	2727€ per participant	16 million € in loans		3160€ per participant
	2011: 1,38 milliard €			2009: 295 million €
	2759€ per participant	In addition the state subsidised		3070€ per participant
		the measure with 20 million $\in$ .		2010: 362 million €
	(Including both grant and loan)			3464€ per participant
				2011: 416 million €
				3540€ per participant
Participants	2008: 440 300	2011: 47 544 (8% of all post-	In 2013, 800 colleges and	2008: 89 100

Evaluation of the Complimentary	2009: 479 200 2010: 502 340 2011: 500 180 (Both grant and loan; approximately 2/3 take the loan in addition to the grant) <b>The measure</b> Not necessary	compulsory graduates)	training providers have joined the scheme.	2009: 96 100 2010: 104 500 2011: 117 500 Free transportation or financial
measures				support for transportation for all participants.
Strengths	Is universal Includes virtually all citizens Is given directly to the student Is principally granted independently of parents' or family's financial situation	Equal opportunities (low income mustn't prevent you from studying).	NA	Students are not uncertain whether they can get a student state grant and/or loan. It is a right.
Weaknesses	NA	Cantons have different regulations. Equality of opportunities applies only to peers in your own canton and not to peers of another canton.	NA	NA
Overall assessment of the measure	The Government's view is that the objectives of the study support system are met. The measure has been in effect since 1965.	NA	The scheme only recently launched, no assessment can be given at this time.	No assessment was given, but the measure has been in effect since 1970.
Comments and further information sources		http://stipendien.educa.ch/de/nod e/2384 http://stipendien.educa.ch/de/stat istiken		The state most often finances a relatively large amount of the direct expenditures connected to the education (to the education provider). Grants and loans therefore often only serves as an income for other living expenses. <u>http://fivu.dk/en/education-and-</u>

	institutions/grants-and-lo	oans/su-
	2013-the-danish-student	- <u>S-</u>
	grants-and-loans-scheme	<u>e</u>

## 2.4 Tax incentives

	Switzerland	Switzerland	USA	The Netherlands
	Tax exemption for individuals	Tax exemption for	Lifetime Learning Credit	Employers tax relief (WVA -
		organizations		Wet vermindering afdracht)
Goal	Tax exemptions for individuals	VAT exemption to encourage	The lifetime learning credit	Encouraging employers in
	to help adults update their	education providers to provide	helps parents and students pay	offering work training courses.
	competencies.	more opportunities.	for post-secondary education.	
Target group	Residents of the country	Education providers	Income up to \$124,000 (94	Employers (certified training
	Any educational background		433€) if married filing jointly;	companies)
	Employed		\$62,000 (47 205€) if single.	
Description of the	Training costs for strictly work-	All educational activities (such	The tuition and fees paid at most	Employers who offer work
measure	related training (non-formal and	as lectures, training,	colleges and universities for the	training courses to students get a
	formal)	examinations etc.) can be	enrolment or attendance of the	compensation for the guidance
		exempted from the VAT.	taxpayer, the taxpayer's spouse,	of students in that work training
			or any dependent of the	trajectory.
			taxpayer are tax deductible. If	
			taxes are filed jointly the credit	
0			is counted per person.	11 / 27000 6 11 1
Size of the	Lump-sum deduction from	100% exempt from the tax.	This credit allows for a 20% tax	Up to 2700€ per full work
support	income (ca. 500 CHF (405€)) or deduction of "real costs"		credit for first \$10,000 (7500€) of qualified tuition and expenses	training trajectory.
	(course fees)		to be fully creditable against the	
	Lump-sum deduction or		taxpayer's total tax liability. For	
	deduction of training costs for		the tax year, you may be able to	
	strictly work-related training		claim a lifetime learning credit	
	(non-formal and formal)		of up to $$2,000$ (1500€) for	
			qualified education expenses	
			paid for all students enrolled in	
			eligible educational institutions.	
Types of learning	Tertiary education	All	Post-secondary	Secondary and tertiary
supported	Formal vocational education		-	education.
	Work/labour market related			
	training (including all training			
	that is directly applicable on the			

	labour market)			
Administrative a	nd organizational aspects			
Administrative body	Governmental tax offices	Governmental tax offices	Governmental tax offices (IRS)	Governmental organisation
Role of the administrative body	Decides who are eligible.	Decides who are eligible.	Decides who are eligible.	Decides who are eligible.
Role of the participant	Chooses the curriculum and education provider, submits relevant documentation after training activities.	-	Chooses the curriculum and education provider, submits relevant documentation after training activities.	Makes arrangements with school and pupil over the education and training program.
Role of education providers	NA	Use the tax benefits.	Provide relevant documentation (tax forms)	Makes arrangements with the company and pupil over the education and training program
Quality assurance	No quality assurance measures are used for education providers. The participant has to prove that training is work related.	No quality assurance measures are used.	Education providers need to be accredited in order for the student to receive the tax benefit. Also the schools need to provide the students with necessary documentation which prove eligibility.	Company must be recognized training company and training should meet the quality conditions. There is a sample-based control by the executor, after payment of the grant.
Communication of the measure	Tax brochures	Tax brochures	Tax brochuresWebsiteoforganizations	Website and through the executor of the scheme.
Evaluation of the	measure			
Complimentary measures	NA	NA	Not necessary.	Each year the scheme was evaluated and the data analysed on applications.
Strengths	NA	NA	Fairly low administrative burden, easily accessible for participants.	Fairly low administrative burden, easily accessible for participants.
Weaknesses	Windfall loss (those with high income benefit most). The measure is not fit to increment	NA	Insufficient tax liability due to low income levels, competing tax credits and deductions, and	There is a control by sample by the executor, after payment of the grant - not a full control on

	participation of low qualified and low income.		the interaction with other aid programs prevents many low- income individuals from qualifying for the aid (Long 2004). Tax-based aid largely serves as a transfer to middle-income students that would have attended college anyway (Turner 2010).	all paid grants. The measure is easy to exploit.
Overall assessment of the measure	In effect since 1940, participation hasn't been measured precisely.	NA	NA	After 5 years due to unsatisfactory evaluations the measure in this form was not extended, the scheme will be replaced by one that tries to save the good things of the measure, but ban the exploitation.
Comments and further information sources		http://www.estv.admin.ch/mwst/ dokumentation/00130/00947/01 033/index.html?lang=de (605.530.20 MWST Branchen- Info 20)	This tax incentive is one of several applied in the USA, for more information: http://www.irs.gov/uac/Tax- Benefits-for-Education:- Information-CenterLong(2004) http://www.nber.org/chapters/c1 0099 TurnerTurner(2010) http://escholarship.org/uc/item/6 758069gNB! Both of these evaluation use old data and the measure has been partly reformed since.	Previous evaluations: 2007 Seor evaluatie afdrachtvermindering onderwijs van de wva 2012 Regioplan www.regioplan.nl/publicaties/ra pporten/evaluatie_afdrachtsver mindering_onderwijs_wva (not available yet)

### 2.5 Grants

	Sweden	Denmark	Denmark	Denmark
	Student aid (grant and loan)	State educational grant for adults (SVU)	State educational grant and loan (SU)	State grant system for adult training (VEU)
Goal	It is intended to make it easier to study and thereby contribute to a high level of participation in the education system. Moreover, it is intended to level out the differences between individuals and groups in the population so as to make society fairer.	Students receive grants every month financed by the state if they start from employment. The grant will cover a part of the lost income from not being able to work.	Society lends students a helping hand in covering living costs for a great variety of courses and studies to support studying regardless of social standing. <i>The scheme is aimed at younger</i> <i>people but adults can also</i> <i>receive it.</i>	Aimed at encouraging the participation of low-skilled people by compensating loss of income for the person or the loss of productive work hours for the employer.
Target group	Citizens and residents Any educational background Any labour market status Age limitations vary by type of learning, generally including all adults up to 54 years of age.	Citizens Any educational background Employed Aged 25+ Non-citizens need to meet additional criteria.	Citizens Any educational background Any labour market status Aged 18+ Non-citizens need to meet additional criteria.	Lower-Secondary (or less) Upper-Secondary Without vocational education Employed in Denmark
Description of the measure	Student aid can be granted for full- or part-time studies. Student aid consists partly of a loan and partly of a grant that is disbursed for the period of study, normally 40 weeks per academic year. There are some limitations on the right to student aid that are linked to the period of study and to the student's age.	The scheme offers course applicants the opportunity to receive an income, while being away from work, to participate in specific types of further education. The SVU is equivalent to 80% of the maximum unemployment benefit rate. The support payable is calculated on the basis of the	When you start a full-time education, you can apply for at state educational grant. You receive the grant every month. The state grant is taxed like any other income. The study grant is paid to a NemKonto in monthly instalments. A NemKonto is an ordinary bank account which the student already has and which	Low skilled and skilled participants are entitled to a fixed allowance corresponding to the level of maximum unemployment benefit rate. It is a subsidy to the employer, since the employer needs to pay a wage, even though the employee is attending school and not working.

The sum paid as a student grant	number of working hours lost.	the public authorities use when	Companies paying regular
is equal for all and is adjusted		they pay out money.	wages to employees
annually to follow the general	The SVU scheme is available to	There are two main support	participating in adult vocational
development of prices in society.	people employed or self-	programmes.	training programmes are entitled
The student grant comprises	employed in Denmark, and is	1. Students following a youth	to receiving the grant instead of
around one-third of the total	divided into two levels. The first	education program i.e. a general	the student.
amount of student aid and is tax-	is for participants in subsidized	upper secondary, vocational	The subsidy is financed by the
free and pensionable. Students	instruction at primary/lower	upper secondary or vocational	employers as a tax scheme - all
with children receive a special	secondary and upper secondary	education and training program.	companies pay according to how
child allowance.	school (also called general	No time limits are placed on this	many employees they have.
	education). The second is for	type of support.	If this tax on the companies does
	participants in higher education.	2. Students enrolled in higher	not cover the full expenditure
	The requirements for the two	education courses are entitled to	the state finances the difference.
	levels differ slightly.	a number of monthly grants	
		corresponding to the prescribed	
	For participants in general	duration of the chosen study,	
	education there's additional	plus 12 months. Inside a	
	support to cover tuition fees.	maximum of 70 grants students	
		can change from one course to	
		another.	
		On completion of their studies,	
		students must start paying back	
		the State loans. The repayment	
		must begin one year after the	
		end of the year, in which they	
		have completed their studies.	
		The duration of the period of	
		repayment must not exceed 15	
		years.	
		The interest rate is 4% yearly	
		during the time of attaining	

				education, after finishing the	
				education it is max 1%.	
				There are additional criteria	
				regarding the size of students'	
				income in order to obtain grants.	
Size of	the	Student aid for full-time studies	The SVU is equivalent to 80%	The amount of the grant depends	Allowance corresponding to the
support		in 2012 amounts to	of the maximum unemployment	on the education level and where	level of maximum
		approximately SEK	benefit rate-in 2013: 3204 DKK	you live:	unemployment benefit rate.
		9 660(1112€) per month of	(430€)/week of 37 hours. The	Students living with their	[Maximum rate of
		studies (nine months/year).	support is calculated on the basis	parents: 2860 DKK (383€) per	unemployment benefits in 2012:
		However, student aid is usually	of the number of working hours	month.	3940 DKK (528€)/ week.]
		disbursed four weeks at a time	lost. The SVU economic support	Students living on their own:	
		for 10 months per year. The total	may be given for up to 40 weeks	5753 DKK (771€) per month.	
		sum for each four week period in	(of 37 hours) for education at		
		2012 amounts to SEK 8 920	lower levels and 40 weeks for		
		(1026€).	education at higher levels.		
			Participation in education that		
			does not add up to a loss of at		
			least 37 working hours will not		
			be eligible for support.		
Types	of	Formal general education	Formal general education	Formal general education	Tertiary education
learning		Tertiary education	Tertiary education	Tertiary education	Formal vocational education
supported		Formal vocational education	Formal vocational education	Formal vocational education	Work/labour market related
II .		Work/labour market related			training (including all training
		training (including all training			that is directly applicable on the
		that is directly applicable on the			labour market)
		labour market)			
		Non-work related training			
		(including liberal education etc.)			
		Civic education			

Administrative	and organizational aspects			
Administrative	Governmental organization CSN	The Danish Agency for Higher	The grant and loan system is	Governmental and non
body	- The National Board of Student	Education and Educational	managed by the Danish Agency	governmental organizations.
	Aid; 900 people are employed to	Support in collaboration with	for Higher Education and	
	implement this measure.	specific educational institutions	Educational Support in	
		and unemployment funds and	collaboration with all	
		under the auspices of the Danish	educational institutions and	
		Ministry of Science, Innovation	under the auspices of the Danish	
		and Higher Education.	Ministry of Science, Innovation	
			and Higher Education.	
Role of the	CSN decides who qualifies,	Decides who is eligible; co-	Decides who is eligible; co-	Aids in choosing the suitable
administrative	coordinates cooperation between	ordinates cooperation between	ordinates cooperation between	form and theme of studies and
body	different stakeholders; reports	different stakeholders.	different stakeholders.	decides who are eligible.
	thoroughly, co-finances.			
Role of the	Chooses the suitable curriculum,	Chooses the suitable curriculum	Chooses the suitable curriculum	Is involved in choosing the
participant	educational institution, applies	and education provider.	and education provider, may co-	theme and form of training and
	for support and provides		finance studies.	the suitable education provider.
	necessary paperwork after			
	studies, co-finances studies.			
Role of	Provide information about	Provide information about	Provide information about	Provide information about
education	learning opportunities, also	learning opportunities, also	learning opportunities, also	learning opportunities, caree
providers	career counselling. After studies	career counselling. Need to	career counselling, and decide	counselling and decides who are
	are concluded submits	submit relevant documentation	who are eligible. Need to submit	eligible; needs to submit relevant
	appropriate documents.	and report thoroughly on	relevant documentation and	documentation after studies are
		training activities.	report thoroughly on training	finished.
			activities.	
Role of the	None	Provide information about	None	Provide information abou
employers		learning opportunities; must		learning opportunities and caree
		accept education plan and co-		counselling; choose the
		finance.		appropriate form and theme o

				training and the most suitable
				education provider alongside the
				participant; co-finance.
Quality	Only students in education	There is no direct control over	There is no direct control over	NA
assurance	institutions satisfying the	the use of money.	the use of money.	
	qualification criteria and expert			
	assessment can receive the			
	support. Use of the money by			
	students is not inspected.			
Communication	Website	Special website	Special website	Special website
of the measure	Information hotline	Websites of existing government	Websites of existing government	Websites of existing government
		agencies or education providers	agencies or education providers	agencies or education providers
Financing				
Source	State budget	State budget	State budget	Tax on companies
Spending	NA	2008: 54 million €	2008: 1,5 milliard €	2008: 161 million €
		Per participant 3369€	Per participant 4636€	
	(For combined expenses for both	2009: 67 million €	2009: 1,6 milliard€	2009: 215 million €
	grant and loan see training loan	Per participant 2572€	Per participant 4815€	
	section)	2010: 94 million €	2010: 1,8 milliard €	2010: 174 million €
		Per participant 3173€	Per participant 4940€	
		2011: 80 million €	2011: 2 milliard €	2011: 107 million €
		Per participant 2333€	Per participant 5084€	
		2012: 54 million €		2012: 94 million €
		Per participant 2171€		
Participants	2008: 440 300	2008: 16 025	2008: 315 200	NA
	2009: 479 200	2009: 26 049	2009: 334 100	
	2010: 502 340	2010: 29 621	2010: 364 300	
	2011: 500 180	2011: 34 290	2011: 393 400	
		2012: 24 870		
Evaluation of the	e measure			

Complimentary	Not necessary	NA	Free transportation or financial	Free transportation or financial
measures			support for transportation for all	support for transportation and
			participants.	free accommodation or financial
				support for accommodation for
				those in need.
Strengths	Is universal	People are financially able to	Students are not uncertain	Companies have incentives to let
	Includes virtually all citizens	start education even though they	whether they can get a student	their employees attend school,
	Is given directly to the student	are older;	state grant and/or loan. It is a	since they get a subsidy and
	Is principally granted	companies have incentives to let	right.	hence do not have any additional
	independently of parents' or	their employees attend school,		costs.
	family's financial situation	since they get a subsidy and		
		hence don't have any additional		
		costs.		
Weaknesses	NA	It is expensive for the state.	It is expensive for the state.	It can seem like an
				administrative burden for
				employers to apply for the grant,
				if the education only last for a
				short time (like a few days).
Overall	The Government's view is that	NA	No assessment was given, but	There is quite a lot of
assessment of	the objectives of the study		the measure has been in effect	administrative work involved,
the measure	support system are met. The		since 1970.	since a lot of people are only
	measure has been in effect since			attending education shortly,
	1965.			which results in a high flow.
Comments and		http://fivu.dk/en/education-and-	It is important to note, that the	https://www.workindenmark.dk/
further		institutions/grants-and-	state most often finances a	en/Find_information/Informatio
information		loans/state-educational-support-	relatively large amount of the	n for job seekers/Working in
sources		for-adults	direct expenditures connected to	Denmark/Unemployment_insura
Comments and			the education (to the education	nce/Unemployment_benefits
further			provider).	
information			Grants and loans therefore often	

sources		only serves as an income for	
		other living expenses.	
		http://www.su.dk/English/Sider/	
		agency.aspx	

# **2.6 Training funds**

	Finland	Switzerland	Switzerland	Switzerland
	Adult Education Allowance	VET/PET funds ("employer	VET/PET funds ("tripartite	VET/PET funds ("bipartite
		funds")	funds")	funds of social partners")
Goal	The purpose of the adult	VET/PET funds are used to	Funds are used to provide for	
	education allowance is to	cover the cost of promotion of	VET/PET and CET measures	funds. Finances individual work
	support employees' and self-	specific occupations, VET and	(not linked to any specific	related training (formal and non-
	employed persons' voluntary	PET activities e.g. development	economic branch).	formal)
	vocational studies.	of training programmes,		
		organising courses and		
		qualification procedures,		
		promotion of specific		
		occupations.		
Target group	Citizens	Target groups are not individuals	Does not target individuals but	*
	Any educational background	but employers and/or course	course providers.	restrictions
	Employed or unemployed	providers.		Any educational background
	Aged 20+		Education providers of:	Employed
	The applicant's full-time	Participating individuals need to	Upper-Secondary (VET)	Aged 15+
	employment relationship with	be aged 15+.	Tertiary education (PET)	
	the same employer or pension-		Vocational education	Only for employees covered by
	insured entrepreneurship must		Without vocational education	the collective labour agreement.
	have lasted for at least one year.			Sometimes restricted to a
	Employed by a Finnish		Participating individuals need to	defined range of courses.
	employer or have worked as a		be aged 15+.	
	self-employed person in Finland			
	for at least eight years.			
Description of	To qualify for the allowance, the	VET/PET funds are an initiative	Cantonal "tax" which applies to	Depending on the fund the
the measure	applicant must participate in	of companies in a given	total labour cost (or number of	money can be spent on financing
	studies leading to degree, or in	economic branch.	contracts) of companies on the	training or also for
	vocational further or continuing	The Confederation may declare	territory of the Canton.	accommodation and such.
	training organised by a Finnish	some VET/PET funds to be of		
	educational institution under	general interest and therefore		
	public supervision. The granted	mandatory for all companies		
	allowance is a lump sum, which	within a given economic branch.		
	can be spent to cover different	(No state money involved in		

[]				, ,
	costs of studying. Maximum	these funds!)		
	time for the allowance is 18	Some funds refund course-costs		
	months, if the allowance is not	to employers who train people.		
	used in this time it will be taken	(VET/PET and CET)		
	back. Training activities must			
	last at least two months or 43			
	days of full time studying.			
Size of the	In 2013 basic allowance 697,89€	Companies' contributions to	Tax depends on the sum of all	Depends on the agreement.
support	/ month + earnings-related	VET/PET funds depend on	salaries. E.g. 0.1%-0.08%	
	allowance, which is 45% from	number of employees of the		
	the difference of the salary and	branch.		
	basic allowance	Re-funding by the VET/PET		
		fund depends on the number of		
		persons trained. (The measure is		
		designed in order to equally		
		distribute costs for VET/PET		
		training among all the		
		companies of the economic		
		branch (whether they train or		
		not).)		
Types of	Formal general education	Formal general education	Formal general education	Tertiary education
learning	Tertiary education	Tertiary education	Tertiary education	Formal vocational education
supported	Formal vocational education	Formal vocational education	Formal vocational education	Work/labour market related
Supported	Work/labour market related	Work/labour market related	Work/labour market related	training (including all training
	training (including all training	training (including all training	training (including all training	that is directly applicable on the
	that is directly applicable on the	that is directly applicable on the	that is directly applicable on the	labour market)
	labour market)	labour market)	labour market)	Formalization of informal
	labour market)	Formalization of informal	Formalization of informal	learning (e.g. paying for
		learning (e.g. paying for	learning (e.g. paying for	professional examination)
		professional examination)	professional examination)	professional examination)
		Funds decide on the training	professional examination)	
		8		
A duniniatus 4!	and angenizational agreets	that is financed by the fund.		
	and organizational aspects		NT A	
Administrative	The Education Fund is a fund	Non-governmental professional	NA	Private sector organizations
body	administered by the social	organisations		

	partners of the Finnish labour			
	1			
	market. Its purpose is to support			
	employees' vocational studies			
	by granting them financial			
	assistance and to support the			
	development of the vocational			
	qualification system by granting			
	scholarships for competence-			
	based qualifications. The fund			
	also provides information and			
	advice on benefits and makes			
	proposals for the development of			
	legislation within its field.			
Role of the	Is involved in choosing the	Decides on the curriculum along	Decides on the curriculum and	Regulations of the fund
administrative	curriculum, decides who are	with the employers, chooses	appropriate education provider,	determine who is eligible and
body	eligible, coordinates cooperation	education providers; provides	provides career counselling and	most decisions are made in
	between different stake holders	information about learning	decides who are eligible,	cooperation by the social
		opportunities. Some also have	organizes training and reports	partners. They also organize the
		their own PET colleges.	thoroughly on it afterwards.	training and career counselling
		Coordinates the cooperation		and coordinate the cooperation
		between different stake holders,		by themselves.
		organizes training activities; is		
		obliged to give feedback and to		
		report thoroughly on training		
		activities. The bylaws of the		
		funds dictate eligibility.		
Role of the	Decides on the curriculum and	Takes part in training activities.	Takes part in training activities.	Decides on the curriculum and
participant	education provider, co-finances	· · · ·	· · · ·	education provider along with
	and is obliged to give feedback			the employer. Provides feedback
	after training activities, submit			on training activities and submits
	relevant documentation and			relevant documentation after
	report thoroughly on the training			training.
	activities.			<b>5</b> 1
Role of	Provide information about	-	Submit relevant documentation	Provide information about
	learning opportunities and career		and report thoroughly on	learning opportunities and

providers	counselling, may co-finance.		training activities.	organize training.
Quality	The applicant has to give	Purposeful use of the money is	NA	NA
assurance	evidence that the employer has	assured by controlling of		
	granted study leave and he or	financial reporting of the funds		
	she has got a studying place.	by the State.		
Communication	Special website	No special efforts were made to	NA	Pamphlets in workplaces
of the measure		reach the target group.		
Financing				
Source	The Education Fund is financed	All companies of an economic	Special (tax) fund for	1 1 0
	by the Unemployment Insurance	branch share the costs.	VET/PET/CET	the agreement both employers
	Fund and the state.		Training may be co-financed by	and employees may be required
			employers.	to co-finance.
Spending	2009: 28,7 Million €	NA	NA	NA
	Per participant: 943€/			
	month on average			
	2012: 94,7 Million €			
	Per participant: 1499€/ month on average			
Participants	2009: 7 319	NA	NA	NA
Farticipants	2009. 7 519 2010: 8 852	1NA	1NA	
	2010: 0.052			
	2012: 13 456			
Evaluation of the				
Complimentary	NA	NA	NA	Depending on the collective
measures				agreement.
Strengths	It helps financially the adult	Costs of training (development	All companies (who benefit	0
Ū.	people to update their	of training programmes etc.) are	from well trained employees)	employees willing to train
	competences and/or obtain a	co-financed by all the companies	pay a tax in order to contribute	themselves.
	new profession.	who benefit from trained people.	to training structures.	
		Empowerment of professional		
		organisations leads to up-to-date		
		training programmes.		
Weaknesses	There could be more adult	Administrative burden for	Overlap with "employer funds".	NA
	learners benefitting from this	professional organisations is		
	allowance; especially men and	high. "Branch" definition is		

	representatives of other underrepresented groups (80 % of beneficiaries are women!).	sometimes confusing; some companies have to contribute to different funds.		
Overall assessment of the measure	The measure has been in place since 2003, before that since 1970 under different name: "eroraharahasto". Currently the	The State is only involved when a fund is declared mandatory. (Besides, the State only deals with administrative appeals and controlling of financial reporting.) This means low	fund. In general: the more exceptions the regulation foresees (e.g. in order to avoid overlap with "employer funds"), the bigger the administrative	No assessment was given.
Comments and further		http://www.sbfi.admin.ch/berufs bildung/01421/index.html?lang=	http://www.sbfi.admin.ch/berufs bildung/01421/01424/index.html	
information sources		de	<u>?lang=de</u>	

## References

Cedefop (2009a) Individual learning accounts - Cedefop Panorama series. No. 163, CEDEFOP, 2009, 118 p. URL: <u>http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/EN/Files/5192\_en.pdf</u> (11.03.2013).

Cedefop (2009b) Sharing the costs of vocational education and training: An analysis of schemes in the newer EU Member States. Cedefop Panorama series. URL: <u>http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/Files/5199\_EN.PDF</u>.

Cedefop (2009c) Using tax incentives to promote education and training. Cedefop Panorama series. URL: http://www.cedefop.europa.eu/etv/Upload/Information\_resources/Bookshop/536/5180\_en.pdf .

Demmou, L. (2012) Matching Skills And Jobs in Estonia. Economics Department Working Papers No. 1007. OECD Publishing. URL: <u>http://www.oecd-</u> ilibrary.org/docserver/download/5k8xb73hhrd3.pdf?expires=1362996470&id=id&accname=g uest&checksum=10B79FB09BA34B573B0121897F25E6AC (11.03.2013).

Dohmen, D.; Timmermann, D. (2010) Financing Adult Learning in times of crisis.BackgroundreportfortheWorkshop.URL:http://www.kslll.net/Documents/ALWG\_Workshop%20Financing%20Adult%20Learning\_background%20report.pdf(11.03.2013).

Eurydice network (2011) Adults in formal education: policies and practice in europe. Education, Audiovisual and Culture Executive Agency. URL: <u>http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/education/eurydice/documents/thematic\_reports/128EN.pdf</u>.